ARGYLL & BUTE COUNCIL

BUTE AND COWAL AREA COMMITTEE

DEVELOPMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

3 JUNE 2014

LIGHTING AT SANDBANK PLAY PARK AND BROXWOOD ROADS DEPOT

1. SUMMARY

1.1 This report provides an update to Members on lighting at Sandbank Play Park.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that Members note the report and agree how to progress lighting at Sandbank Play Park

3. DETAILS

- 3.1 At its meeting held in October 2012 Bute and Cowal Area Committee considered the attached request and business case. Subsequent to the meeting, members and officers met and at that time it was agreed not to progress lighting at the Sandbank Play Park.
- 3.2 At the Bute and Cowal Business Day in May 2014, members considered a report on this matter, the outcome of which was:
 - 1. Members noted the report;
 - 2. Members suggested that a change be made in the capital spend for the Cowal ward, to be used towards the lighting at Sandbank Play Park, asked that Members from ward 6 have a discussion on this and that a further report come back to the June Area Committee; and
 - 3. Members asked the Head of Roads and Amenity Services to find out more information about the stored lighting columns in Broxwood and bring an update on this to the June Area Committee.
- 3.3 The estimated cost for providing lighting to the play park is £6800 based on current costs.
- 3.4 The Broxwood Roads Depot is a historic depot which is predominantly used for the storage of street lighting equipment to be used in the Cowal area. Lighting columns, cables and other materials are kept at this site for use in both revenue and capital works. The materials held at this location are funded through existing street lighting budgets. There is an aspiration to move to a single depot location within the Dunoon area. However, an existing long term lease which would be cost prohibitive

to terminate early has resulted in a single depot not being cost effective at this moment in time. The use of Broxwood as a street lighting store is being reviewed with a view to co-locating street lighting with one of the other Council depots. A business case will be developed to see if this is a cost effective and operationally feasible proposal.

4. CONCLUSION

4.1 This report provides an update to Members on lighting at Sandbank Play Park.

5. IMPLICATIONS

5.1	Policy	None
5.2	Financial	No budget allocated

5.3 Legal None

5.4 HR None

5.5 Equalities None known

5.6 Risk None known

5.7 Customer Services None

6. APPENDICES

Appendix 1 – Report to Bute and Cowal Area Committee meeting in October 2012

Appendix 2 – Business Case for lighting at Sandbank Play Park

ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL

BUTE AND COWAL AREA COMMITTEE

DEVELOPMENT AND INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

OCT 2012

SANDBANK PLAY AREA - PROVISION OF FLOOD LIGHTING

1.0 SUMMARY

1.1 This report deals with the request from Sandbank Community Council and Elected Members for the Council to provide and maintain Flood Lighting at the recently redeveloped Sandbank Play Area

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 Members are asked to consider the report and attached appendices.

3.0 DETAILS

- 3.1 A Memorandum of Agreement to allow the redevelopment of the existing play area and replacement of play equipment was signed with Sandbank Community Council in 2008, to allow external funds to be raised for the Capital scheme.

 A copy is attached in Appendix 2
- 3.2 The inclusion of a Multi Use Games Area (MUGA) was a Community aspiration which developed during the selection of play equipment and play area reconfiguration in the period of fund raising by the Community Group. During this time the requirement for lighting was not included in the requirements for Capital Fundraising.
- 3.3 Requests from Community Groups members and Elected Members have been received by Officers since the completion of the finalised works. Initially the powering and maintenance of normal street lighting was considered a viable proposition, as this could be incorporated within the impending Capital Lighting Replacement scheme 2012 for Sandbank Shore rd.
- 3.4 However the IBC, gives several reasons why the increased commitment to provide, power and maintain Flood Lighting cannot be sustained by the present budget allocations and how this contravenes the present aim of the Council to minimise the inclusion of lighting systems out with the Council Asset, connected to the public lighting network. Furthermore there are clearly indentified concerns from Strathclyde Police on the potential disbenefit of increased lighting and potential in appropriate use of this facility which is not situated on Council land.

4.0 CONCLUSION

4.1 The provision and maintenance by the Council of Flood Lighting at Sandbank MUGA is unsustainable within present and future budgets and is against the Council aim to minimise Liability and Risk on assets out with their direct control.

5.0 IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 Policy Complies with aim to achieve a sustainable asset.
- 5.2 Financial No additional Capital or Revenue Budget available.
- 5.3 Legal None
- 5.4 HR None
- 5.5 Equalities None
- 5.6 Risk Avoids risk and liability to Council on use of MUGA.
- 5.7 Customer Service Does not affect Council commitment to routine maintenance of play area and equipment in the memorandum of Agreement

6.0 APPENDICES

- 6.1 APPENDIX 1 Initial Business Case Funding and Maintenance of Flood Lighting at Sandbank Play area (Multi Use Games Area)
- 6.2 APPENDIX 2 Original Memorandum of Agreement 2008 play area and original childrens' play equipment upgrade.

Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure ServicesSept 2012

For further information contact: Callum Robertson 01631 569197

Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure April 2014

For further information contact: Jim Smith, Head of Roads and Amenity Services Tel: 01546 604324

Appendix 2

Argyll & Bute Council

Initial Business Case for Capital Projects

<u>Department</u> – Development and Infrastructure <u>Service</u> – Roads and Amenity

Asset Type – Play Area Lighting

Project Name - Sandbank Play Area Lighting

Executive Summary

There has been a request that the Sandbank play area be illuminated.

There is no identified funding for this work and does not feature in any future plans.

The play park area is not in the ownership of the Council.

The police and Community Council have concerns re youth disorder at the present time and it is felt that lighting the area may exacerbate this problem.

If the scheme was to go ahead there would be issues of safety to be resolved especially around activation and maintenance of these lights.

Impact on Council plans

None

Affordability

- The cost of installing this scheme would be between £4500 £5000 with an ongoing maintenance cost.
- No budget from a revenue or capital is identified within the St Lighting sections remits.
- Other sources of budget would require to be identified for both installation and ongoing maintenance.
- Electrical consumption of floodlighting is a lot higher than our preferred luminaire.
- Hinged columns will have to be installed to allow ease of access for maintenance (3
 TIMES COST OF NORMAL POLES)

- Installation of some form of switch to enable disconnection of lights when not in use (normally A&B council insist that this must be done by an appropriately qualified person)
- Electrical bonding required for adjacent fence
- Installation of RCBO to enable EEBADS protecting anyone using the facility at additional cost
- Ongoing maintenance required (inspection & testing a statutory requirement at least once every six years)

Deliverability

- The St Lighting team within Roads and Amenity have the skills to design and deliver this work.
- The St Lighting inhouse team could install all the required elements of this scheme.
- There is a planned St Lighting scheme planned for this year adjacent to this site. As part of those works a power supply, for the flood lights can be easily incorporated into the larger scheme.

Risk

Environmental

- Height of column required will impact on outlook (towards sea) from nearby housing
- Floodlighting creates significantly more lighting trespass and intrusion than our normal lanterns
- Appearance of floodlighting required not aesthetically pleasing
- Type of lighting required to meet lighting levels required is in contrast to our lighting policy of trying to reduce levels of lighting output and electrical loading.

Policy

- We are currently trying to reduce the number of lighting points that we have to maintain in general and more appropriately on ground that is not adopted by the council not only for financial reasons but also for legal implications.
- IF this lighting installation does go ahead, will Argyll & Bute council have ownership of the sports court. (What happens if there is a failure and we cannot gain access to the sports court to repair or electrically isolate)
- Will Argyll & Bute Council be exempt from any future legal challenges that may occur for example, if an on court sports injury occurs when one of the lighting points wasn't operating fully (policy for this eventuality required)

Public Safety

Report on police view

- Additional lighting of any location can be a useful crime prevention tool, aid public reassurance and decrease the fear of crime. However, on its own, the positive effects can be minimal and can, if used incorrectly, increase problems in a given area.
- The main crime prevention purpose of lighting is to facilitate natural surveillance during the hours of darkness. Due to this, solely adding floodlights at this play park will be insufficient.
- A visit to this site confirms that natural surveillance is extremely low in this area. Only three
 domestic properties have a clear overview of the play park. This natural surveillance is
 further decreased due to their position being set some distance back from the dividing
 roadway, between their properties and the play park, in addition to shrubbery and trees
 within their grounds further blocking any natural view.
- Natural surveillance is further compounded due to the amount and density of vegetation growing in and around the play park. This decreases the surveillance potential from both vehicle and pedestrian traffic in the vicinity.
- Over the preceding three months, there has been one recorded incident of a member of the
 public complaining of youths within the play park causing damage. On this occasion
 damage could not be proven, however it was recorded that there was old damage to
 property within and the member of the public did comment that such incidents were a
 regular occurrence.
- Play parks are a natural attraction of youths of all ages. This play park can be seen to be such due to its location, its comfortable surroundings with seating available, adequate lighting from nearby street lights, hidden views due to vegetation, and even a covered bus shelter which offers a ready-made 'teen shelter' for adverse weather.
- Due to the above, adding floodlights by themselves would not be recommended as the question would be; who are you lighting the area for?
- Additional lighting could work however, if further measures were taken into account. At the very least, vegetation must be cut back to allow natural surveillance of the play park area,

and thereafter a maintenance program put in place to ensure that this continues. It would also be advisable to enquire into whether the bus shelter could be either replaced with a more open design, or moved further along the road, possibly nearer to Wallace Court.

- Signage should also be highly visible, informing users of any age restrictions and ownership details. This further enhances the belief that the play park is cared for and looked after.
- Any investment in this area should also be made public (eg) Community Council, Primary School, local media, local residents and the Police, in order, not only to inform the reasons behind any work, but also asking for support to report any negative incidents.
- It should be noted that the implementation of the above recommendations might not
 prevent the determined person causing damage or annoyance at this location. However,
 they will make it more difficult, and greatly increase the chance of detection, with the
 resultant decrease in any financial loss to the owner.

Community Council

- Concerns have been expressed by members of the Community council re youth disorder round the play park area. The police are currently giving advice on how best to tackle the problem.
- In light of this problem there would be a real concern that the problems of youth disorder would escalate if lighting was installed.

Operational

Factors such as who would be responsible for the lights after they are installed. How
would they be controlled and by whom. All these factors would need to be established
especially in relation to safety.